



The American Society for Ethnohistory

American Indians and Christian Missions: Studies in Cultural Conflict by Henry Warner Bowden; Indian Missions: A Critical Bibliography by James P. Ronda; James Axtell

Review by: Christopher Vecsey

Ethnohistory, Vol. 30, No. 1 (Winter, 1983), pp. 40-42

Published by: [Duke University Press](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/481505>

Accessed: 22/06/2014 06:39

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Duke University Press and The American Society for Ethnohistory are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Ethnohistory*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

Spirituality," does not aim to be such a work. Its main objective is to present to the general reader a sampling of texts emanating from the Indians themselves and recorded by competent ethnographers and linguists. This is a laudable undertaking, and the editing has been done with great care. The book contains an orienting introduction, examples of Iroquois cosmological myths, gleanings of individual experiences from dreams and visions, a great many examples of clan and society rituals, and some few Southeastern Indian formulas. The text recorders are mostly well-known and reliable anthropologists and linguists of the old school, like Leonard Bloomfield, Truman Michelson, Paul Radin and Frank G. Speck, but also some few scholars of a younger vintage, such as Wallace L. Chafe.

As the editor points out, the good text recordings are concentrated on a few tribes of Iroquoian and Algonkian tongues. The Southeast is unfortunately almost left out of the picture, apparently because of the lack of suitable texts. However, there is much text material collected by Speck, Swanton and Wagner bearing on religious issues. James Mooney's information on religious customs and ideas is also relevant.

To some extent the reviewer has the feeling that Tooker is more concerned about the texts as such, their selection and editing, than about the religions they should present. If first of all we look at the texts, it is obvious that they emphasize rituals at the expense of myths and beliefs. Two thirds of the book deal with ritual texts, some of these, as we could expect, rather dull and repetitive. The author's rationale is that the most important beliefs are stated in rituals (p. 5). This is, according to my understanding, far from correct, but we have been so used to the ritualistic interpretation of religion that such a view nowadays is almost taken for granted. The general reader would have appreciated to read more about myths - some of them very central to Eastern Woodland religion - and individual belief statements. Besides that can be scanned from visionary accounts, such statements are almost completely missing. And yet, there is a bulk of materials concerning them in publications by Densmore, Harrington, Jones and others. I imagine the average reader would have loved to know more about the many supernatural beings - Kichi Manitou, Mother Earth, the Corn Goddess, the Three Sisters, the False Faces, the Thunderbirds, the Masters of the Game, the Dwarves, and what not.

Furthermore, the Introduction could have been more informative. Tooker draws the great lines of the old discussion around the concepts *orenda*, *wakanda* and *manitou*, and thinks that Radin's stricture of this debate (in the *Anthropology in North America* of 1915) was little observed, which however is wrong - at least in Europe Radin's point of view attracted much attention. Tooker connects this debate with Hallowell's interpretation of Ojibway religion in the Festschrift to Radin (*Culture in History*, 1960), and his concept "Beings-other-than-human." This is an interesting approach. However, we miss a broad outline of Eastern Woodlands religion in its relationship to the peculiar social and cultural conditions in the area. Such a background would have served the purpose of this book.

I consider, nevertheless, that this is an important book, bringing together much material on a sadly neglected topic and making it readable to the great public. The editor's lucid power of presentation and the good typography make this volume a handy introduction for common man to the treasures of Indian religions in the Eastern Woodlands.

University of Stockholm

Ake Hultkrantz

American Indians and Christian Missions: Studies in Cultural Conflict. By Henry Warner Bowden. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981. xiii + 255 pp., maps, notes, suggestions for further reading, indices. \$14.95 cloth.)

Indian Missions: A Critical Bibliography. By James P. Ronda and James Axtell. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1978. xi + 85 pp., indices. \$4.95 paper.)

American Indians and Christian Missions is the best and broadest general treatment of relations between Christian missions and North American Indian peoples ever published.

By drawing on the works of previous scholars, Henry Warner Bowden has synthesized a half millenium of history, paying careful attention to both Indian and white roles, both religious and societal dimensions of the contact. His should be the first book any student reads on the subject, supplanting Robert F. Berkhofer's *Salvation and the Savage* (which slights the religious content of missions) and the numerous writings of R. Pierce Beaver (which ignore the Indian responses to missions). This is a work of comparative religion and history, comparing Indian and Christian religious beliefs and practices, and juxtaposing them in a dynamic tension within specific contexts of place and time.

While not examining every tribe and denomination, Bowden manages to look at most aspects of the missionary movement and Indian responses. Picking key points of contact — Spanish Franciscans among the Pueblos, French Jesuits among the Hurons, English Puritans among the New England Algonkians, and so forth, across the centuries and across the continent — he describes tribal values within their cultural-religious network before contact with Europeans, and then gauges the effects of the missionaries on Indian spirituality and life. He shows how some tribes revolted and carried on their faith; how some submitted to the pressure of white intimidation; how some syncretized their faith with that of the Christian intruders.

Bowden indicates the factors in Indian religious life that helped to accept or resist Christianity. Farming tribes with formal priesthods tended to maintain traditions better than acephalous hunters with their scattered individuality. Salient differences between tribal religions and Christianity often made the missionizing faith unpalatable to Indians: the concepts of heaven and hell, in which the saved are separated from the damned, including family members; the idea that human nature is sinful; the exclusivist, dogmatic monotheism. In short, some of the central features of Christianity repelled the Native Americans.

The author possesses the proper irony to see that in their altruism, white clergymen tried to overturn Indian cultures in order to improve them. However, they were so successful in altering the cultures that they ended up destroying “the people they wanted to aid.” Bowden demonstrates this process without sacrificing an appreciation for the missionaries’ motives and intellectual training, and without reducing them to bogeymen. He is also able to discern one mission method from another, Jesuit accommodationism from Franciscan intolerance. At the same time he is not afraid to see the economics and politics of mission, e.g., the Jesuit position as middlemen between Hurons and the French fur trade, or the dependence of nineteenth century ministers on the violent expansionism of American empire. He discusses both the religious and social dimensions of mission, thus highlighting both the tensions and congruences between “civilizing” and “christianizing” Indian peoples.

Despite its merits, however, the book has serious flaws. Bowden’s lack of primary research is evident through most of the book, most glaringly in his sagging overview of pre-Columbian cultures where he repeats the most rudimentary of scholarship. In almost every section he could have either strengthened or modified his claims by reading further in the literature, especially concerning Indian religions. He might learn, for instance, about the Delaware prophets of the mid-eighteenth century, or about Catharine [sic] Brown, the nineteenth century Cherokee convert, or about the numerous federal bans on Indian religions between the 1870s and 1930s. He should learn more about the Ghost Dance and the peyote religion, and other Indian religious movements of the last century, instead of repeating uncritically the writings of a few secondary sources. In addition, his comparisons between Indian and Christian religions can be made more incisive. Finally, the Forword by series editor Martin Marty would have been better left unsaid. With bizarre references to how Indians “underpopulated” America, with evident ignorance about the scholarship regarding American Indian religions, with intolerable double standards (Indians were motivated by their material conditions, whereas white people were motivated idealistically by their Bible!), it detracts from the overall excellence of the book.

A good companion to Bowden's book is *Indian Missions*. It points to some of the major works in the field, viewing missions in secular American cultural contexts and reminding the reader of the active Indian roles in responding to Christian proselytizing.

The difficulty with the book is its neglect of the religious dimensions of missionary-Indian contact; indeed, it shows little interest in either Christianity or Indian religions. Rejecting the "missionary rhetoric" that preachers worked "to save the immortal souls of lost Indians from eternal damnation," the book bypasses the essence of the mission movement — its Christian motives. Eschewing studies of traditional Indian religions, the book leaves the faulty impression that Indians lacked a spiritual life before contact with whites. By overlooking the wealth of scholarship in foreign publications (albeit in English), in journals devoted to religious studies and even missionary history, by leaving out, e.g., the excellent work of Verne Dusenberry on the Montana Cree or Ake Hultkrantz on the Wind River Shoshoni, *Indian Missions* presents an unbalanced portrayal of the mission field. For all its merits as an introductory bibliography, the book lacks the sensitivity to religious phenomena that makes Bowden's book a success.

Colgate University

Christopher Vecsey

The Ioway Indians. By Martha Royce Blaine. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, The Civilization of the American Indian series, 151, 1979. xiv + 364 pp., illustrations, maps, bibliography, indices. \$27.50 cloth.)

The Ioway Indians is good ethnohistory, interweaving the course of history with the available facts of ethnology as they apply to appropriate periods. A brief Prologue introduces the Ioway from their own point of view. The first chapter covers both Mildred Mott Wedel's archaeological work on the Ioway and the earliest documentary evidence of the tribe's first contact with Europeans, including information on the Ioway's position in relation to neighboring tribes. Chapters two through five are not easy reading as they deal with the Ioway's role in the complexity of struggles of European powers to gain control of North America, but Martha Royce Blaine's careful research makes these chapters invaluable for reference purposes. Blaine introduces the bulk of her ethnographic data in chapter six, "Grandfather Has Spoken," in reference to the period when the new United States extended its sovereignty over the Ioway who had meanwhile expanded out of Iowa toward the Missouri River. This is a refreshing departure from the all too common technique of devoting an introductory chapter to tribal culture as if it were a kind of pristine condition persisting unchanged from prehistoric times until white settlement disrupted it. Indeed, the "old" Indian culture as most fully documented in the historical record and the reconstructive ethnographies collected in the early 20th century, really relates to the period of the late 17th to the opening of the 19th centuries when Indian and white history and culture were inextricably bound together.

While the Ioway's archeological past is better established than that of other tribes in the woodland-prairie region, ethnological studies tend to be somewhat fragmentary. What comes through, however, is a picture of the Ioway with one foot in the woodlands and one foot in the plains, using wigwams and teepees, dependent on the horse and buffalo but maintaining gardens, and continuing old religious forms, while clan organization and nascent social ranking, developed further east in settled villages, give way as the Ioway become more mobile. "The Treaty Period," chapter seven, is followed in chapter eight by the "Entreaty Period," when disease, loss of resources and land and the pressure of white settlement bring about division in the tribe. The dominance of the Quakers in reservation affairs during President Grant's administration had particularly disruptive effects on the less than 500 remaining Ioway, as detailed in chapter nine. By 1880, they split into two groups: those who chose the white man's way of family farms at the Great Nemaha Agency reservation in Kansas-Nebraska, and those who sought a new reservation to live in the old communal way